

From: paulbrooke@me.com <paulbrooke@me.com>
Sent: Thursday, July 27, 2023 11:04 AM
To: John Ledwith <jledwith@tuxedopark-ny.gov>
Cc: Elisa Tara Gilbert Esq. <egilbert@gilbert-firm.com>
Subject: Door replacement on art studio

Dear John,

This note is in follow up to our discussion about the broken french doors in the art studio that we built last year.

As you know, the studio was built last year using cedar and mahogany. The cedar doors and windows were raised by the architect at the time as he recommended material of greater engineering. In fact he recommended Marvin and two other companies, Pella and one other. He also noted that they are much more expensive but that he has proposed them on projects in the park and they have been accepted. Indeed, we have seen these double insulated (metal/vinyl) exterior doors on new and old constructions throughout the Village and assume that all these property owners are not operating in violation of the Village's rules.

At the time they were proposed during the design phase we were advised that they are installed on new constructions and on restorations and the MARVIN was the highest quality with the most potential available variation on design to match an existing structure. They are also (unfortunately) the highest priced. We found that they produce the Cadillac of insulated glass products with multiple finishes (including wood tone) and will be manufactured in the exact colonial green that currently exists elsewhere at 34 E Lake, but we elected to proceed with the solid Cedar in the original studio design. This is not to say that the solid cedar painted colonial green with black mullions was inexpensive, they were also absurdly priced, AND not one survived 6 months on the unforested hill facing Tuxedo Lake. Perhaps if we wooded the hill facing the lake the entire structure and the house might have a single wind barrier, but as it is sited, the structures are directly exposed to wind off the lake.

To make a long story short, we completed the structure last August, and by the first heavy winter storm:

1. The first door ripped off entirely, not at the hinges but at the third row of glass panes leaving just a vertical strip of cedar hanging on the hinges. (You have the photo.)
2. The last door ripped off the glass panes at the top row of glass, but remained connected to the hinges and the bottom glass making it impossible to open because it was out of alignment and detached at the top.
3. The third (middle set of doors ripped entirely off the heavy duty spring hinges we utilized instead of the hinges that were delivered with the product).

For several months we had nothing but plywood on the door that ripped off the first set of hinges the last set of doors remained closed (but could not open.) We had the center doors re-hung with industrial strength hinges and screws that went nearly the length of the

doors. We essentially rebuild the last set with spare lumber on the inside, reinforcing the joints that separated and planed down the now unlevelled base to get the door to open again, and initiated exploration of more appropriate options for replacing the door that had been just a sheet of plywood. I also note that despite the unsightly plywood, mismatched door ...it was unnoticeable to anyone in this Village but us.

As you know, the structures at 34 East Lake are at the top of an unobstructed hill facing the lake. There exist absolutely no wind barriers and not infrequently the main house feels like it will find itself in the front yard of the Scherer's residence at 1 East Lake Road. (Fortunately we have warned them to expect a visit and they are amenable.)

Conversely, should the entire structure of the art studio be lifted off its foundation there is an enormous rock structure directly abutting the structure at its rear making the 16x20 tiny structure totally invisible from any angle.

I mention this to remind you that the art studio and all its windows and all its doors too are not visible to any citizen in the Village of Tuxedo Park. Indeed this lovely little structure can be *barely* seen, when searching for it, from even a boat on the lake (and only I care to look so that I can admire its charm). Because there is also a rock wall parapet four to six feet in front of the structure, the doors themselves are just an impression of French doors with a contrasting color to the cedar building and roof, it is certainly not possible to tell that within the doors the edges are green and the mullions are black (a detail we like very much).

Indeed, although the first set of broken doors have remained raw wood for more than half the time the structure has been in existence and not a soul other than me is at all bothered or even can tell.

We got quotes from all the major players in the high end double insulated glass door business. All the companies our architect initially recommended and *only Marvin* offered custom wood tone, colonial green exterior with black mullions on three over five divided lights. They are far more expensive than the Pella option and are more specifically customized to perfectly match what we have and want.

As you are undoubtedly aware, the Marvin products and other double insulated glass manufactured products are approved and in use elsewhere in the Park on both new constructions and on restored structures. The other property owners are very pleased with the options as they are very solid, innocuous, energy efficient, and durable.

Because the doors all need replacement, I elected to replace the set of three French doors with the Cadillac in the industry and customized them to match what we had always wanted. The contractor was Marvin windows and doors. The new doors will be window painted, three over five, and will match existing colors, green around the doors and black on the mullions.

As you recall, I recently replaced the air conditioner generator and condenser units that were in front of the large rock where the studio structure was constructed, I replaced the units with smaller more efficient units and sited them about a foot even closer to the rock and closer together so that the studio could be placed farther off the lake and closer to the large rock. That "replacement" did not require a BAR process. Here this is a replacement not a new construction, the solid wood doors that I would have liked to be adequate were unfortunately unable to endure the Tuxedo Park winter winds. This 'replacement' is not only necessary but will (hopefully) prevent annual repeated experiences.

As I am *replacing* existing doors that broke because they were inadequate. In your capacity as building inspector, Marvin provided you with the replacement plans to confirm that they are substantively

exactly the design that was on the structure initially and other than considerably higher quality will make no change to the appearance of the structure.

Please let me know if there is anything more I need to do.

Cordially,

Paul

Paul Brooke
(917) 860-1133
paulbrooke@me.com



From: John Ledwith
Sent: Thursday, July 13, 2023 1:13 PM
To: Paul Brooke <pbrooke@tuxedopark-ny.gov>
Subject: VTP Building Dept. - Doors

Dear Mr. Brooke,

I have been contacted by two representatives from Marvin regarding changing doors on your recently constructed building. Below are copies of my responses.

I hope you understand that consistent with the Board of Architectural Reviews guidance and past decisions, I have been advised not to accept synthetic materials as substitutes for wood. Any substitutes must be presented and approved by the Board of Architectural Review.

Regards,
John Ledwith
Building Inspector &
Consultant to the Village Board of Trustees
Village of Tuxedo Park
80 Lorillard Rd.
Tuxedo Park, NY 10987
jledwith@tuxedopark-ny.gov
(O) 845-351-4745 ext. 2
(F) 845-351-2668
(M) 845-913-8821

From: John Ledwith
Sent: Thursday, July 13, 2023 1:13 PM
To: Paul Brooke <pbrooke@tuxedopark-ny.gov>
Subject: VTP Building Dept. - Doors

Dear Mr. Brooke,

I have been contacted by two representatives from Marvin regarding changing doors on your recently constructed building. Below are copies of my responses.

I hope you understand that consistent with the Board of Architectural Reviews guidance and past decisions, I have been advised not to accept synthetic materials as substitutes for wood. Any substitutes must be presented and approved by the Board of Architectural Review.

Regards,
John Ledwith
Building Inspector &
Consultant to the Village Board of Trustees
Village of Tuxedo Park
80 Lorillard Rd.
Tuxedo Park, NY 10987
jledwith@tuxedopark-ny.gov
(O) 845-351-4745 ext. 2
(F) 845-351-2668
(M) 845-913-8821

From: John Ledwith
Sent: Wednesday, July 12, 2023 10:26 AM

To: Kristopher Thurston <Kristopher.Thurston@marvin.com>

Subject: RE: VTP Building Dept.

Thurston,

I believe that I spoke to your supervisor yesterday. I relayed the same information that I sent you in the email this past Friday. Please forward this email to your supervisor.

If you would like to attend the BAR meeting next Thursday, July 17th at 5:30 pm to discuss the Board of Architectural Requirements I could add you to the agenda. Please let me know by tomorrow afternoon.

Regards,

John Ledwith

Building Inspector &

Consultant to the Village Board of Trustees

Village of Tuxedo Park

80 Lorillard Rd.

Tuxedo Park, NY 10987

jledwith@tuxedopark-ny.gov

(O) 845-351-4745 ext. 2

(F) 845-351-2668

(M) 845-913-8821

From: John Ledwith

Sent: Friday, July 7, 2023 4:22 PM

To: Kristopher Thurston <Kristopher.Thurston@marvin.com>

Subject: RE: VTP Building Dept.

Kristopher,

I do not have the authority to approve fiberglass or what are considered synthetic or non-traditional building materials. The Board of Architectural would need to approve the change in materials. For your information pages 24 and 25 of the attached Tuxedo Park Architectural Design Guidelines provides guidance on doors.

While I understand the reduced maintenance associated with synthetic materials, the Board of Architectural Review has jurisdiction over the types of materials used on the exterior of a structure.

If you would like to approach the Board of Architectural Review regarding a change in materials, the board meets on the 1st and 3rd Mondays of each month at 5:30 pm. An application and 10 days advance notice is required.

Regards,

John Ledwith

Building Inspector &

Consultant to the Village Board of Trustees

Village of Tuxedo Park

80 Lorillard Rd.

Tuxedo Park, NY 10987

jledwith@tuxedopark-ny.gov

(O) 845-351-4745 ext. 2

(F) 845-351-2668

(M) 845-913-8821
